

On the regime of validity of sound-proof model equations for atmospheric flows

Rupert Klein

Mathematik & Informatik, Freie Universität Berlin

Reading, November 08, 2010

Ulrich Achatz Didier Bresch Omar Knio Fabian Senf

Piotr Smolarkiewicz

(Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt) (Université de Savoie, Chambéry) (Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore) (IAP, Kühlungsborn) (NCAR, Boulder)

Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft



Motivation ... Numerics

Why not simply solve the full compressible equations?



* adapted from Reich et al. (2007)

Why not simply solve the full compressible equations?

Linear Acoustics, simple wave initial data, periodic domain *(integration: implicit midpoint rule, staggered grid,* 512 *grid pts.,* CFL = 10)



Regime(s) of validity of sound-proof models

Background

Stratification limit in the design-regime

Wave-breaking regime with strong stratification

Summary

Atmospheric Flow Regimes



R.K., Ann. Rev. Fluid Mech, 42, 2010

Compressible flow equations

$$\begin{split} \rho_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v) &= 0 & \text{drop term for:} \\ (\rho u)_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v \circ u) + P \nabla_{\parallel} \pi &= 0 & \text{anelastic}^{\dagger} \text{ (approx.)} \\ (\rho w)_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v w) + P \pi_z &= -\rho g & \text{pseudo-incompressible}^* \\ P_t + \nabla \cdot (P v) &= 0 & \text{hydrostatic-primitive} \\ \end{split}$$

$$P = p^{\frac{1}{\gamma}} = \rho \theta, \quad \pi = p/\Gamma P, \quad \Gamma = c_p/R, \quad v = u + wk \quad (u \cdot k \equiv 0)$$

* Durran, JAS, 46, 1453–1461 (1988)

Compressible flow equations

$$\begin{split} \rho_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v) &= 0 & \text{drop term for:} \\ (\rho u)_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v \circ u) + P \nabla_{\parallel} \pi &= 0 & \text{anelastic}^{\dagger} \text{ (approx.)} \\ (\rho w)_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v w) + P \pi_z &= -\rho g & \text{pseudo-incompressible}^* \\ P_t + \nabla \cdot (P v) &= 0 & \text{hydrostatic-primitive} \\ \end{split}$$

$$P = p^{\frac{1}{\gamma}} = \rho \theta, \quad \pi = p/\Gamma P, \quad \Gamma = c_p/R, \quad v = u + wk \quad (u \cdot k \equiv 0)$$

Parameter range & length and time scales of asymptotic validity ?

* Durran, JAS, 46, 1453–1461 (1988)

Regime(s) of validity of sound-proof models

Background

Stratification limit in the design-regime

Wave-breaking regime with strong stratification

Summary

K., Achatz, Bresch, Knio, Smolarkiewicz, JAS, 67, 3226–3237 (2010)

From here on: ϵ is the Mach number

Characteristic (inverse) time scales



Characteristic (inverse) time scales



Ogura & Phillips' regime* with two time scales

$$\overline{\theta} = 1 + \varepsilon^2 \widehat{\theta}(z) + \dots \Rightarrow \frac{h_{\rm sc}}{\overline{\theta}} \frac{d\overline{\theta}}{dz} = O(\varepsilon^2)$$

Characteristic (inverse) time scales



Ogura & Phillips' regime* with two time scales

$$\overline{\theta} = 1 + \varepsilon^2 \widehat{\theta}(z) + \dots \qquad \Rightarrow \qquad \frac{h_{\rm sc}}{\overline{\theta}} \frac{d\overline{\theta}}{dz} = O(\varepsilon^2) \qquad \Rightarrow \qquad \Delta \overline{\theta} \Big|_{z=0}^{h_{\rm sc}} < 1 \text{ K}$$

* Ogura & Phillips (1962)

Desirable:

- 1. Sound-proof model which
- 2. accurately represents the (fast) internal waves, and
- 3. remains accurate over **advective time scales**.

Characteristic (inverse) time scales



Realistic regime with three time scales

$$\overline{\theta} = 1 + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\mu}} \widehat{\theta}(z) + \dots \qquad \Rightarrow \qquad \frac{h_{\rm sc}}{\overline{\theta}} \frac{d\overline{\theta}}{dz} = O(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\mu}}) \qquad (\boldsymbol{\nu} = 1 - \boldsymbol{\mu}/2)$$

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\theta}_{\tau} &+ \frac{1}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} \,\tilde{w} \,\frac{d\widehat{\theta}}{dz} &= -\tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} \cdot \nabla \tilde{\theta} \\ \tilde{\boldsymbol{v}}_{\tau} &+ \frac{1}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} \,\frac{\tilde{\theta}}{\bar{\theta}} \,\boldsymbol{k} &+ \frac{1}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}} \,\overline{\theta} \nabla \tilde{\pi} &= -\tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} \cdot \nabla \tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} - \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{1-\boldsymbol{\nu}} \tilde{\theta} \nabla \tilde{\pi} \\ \tilde{\pi}_{\tau} &+ \frac{1}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}} \left(\gamma \Gamma \overline{\pi} \nabla \cdot \tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} + \tilde{w} \frac{d\overline{\pi}}{dz} \right) = -\tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} \cdot \nabla \tilde{\pi} - \gamma \Gamma \tilde{\pi} \nabla \cdot \tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} \end{split}$$

For the linear variable coefficient system:

- Conservation of weighted quadratic energy
- ✓ Control of time derivatives by initial data ($\tau = O(1)$)

... consider internal wave scalings for $\tau = O(\varepsilon^{\nu})$:

$$\vartheta = \frac{\tau}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\nu}}}, \qquad \pi^* = \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\nu}-1} \tilde{\pi} ,$$

Fast linear compressible / pseudo-incompressible modes

$$\tilde{\theta}_{\vartheta} + \tilde{w} \frac{d\overline{\theta}}{dz} = 0$$
$$\tilde{\boldsymbol{v}}_{\vartheta} + \frac{\tilde{\theta}}{\overline{\theta}} \boldsymbol{k} + \overline{\theta} \nabla \pi^{*} = 0$$
$$\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\mu}} \pi_{\vartheta}^{*} + \left(\gamma \Gamma \overline{\pi} \nabla \cdot \tilde{\boldsymbol{v}} + \tilde{w} \frac{d\overline{\pi}}{dz}\right) = 0$$

Vertical mode expansion (separation of variables)

$$\begin{pmatrix} \tilde{\theta} \\ \tilde{\boldsymbol{u}} \\ \tilde{\boldsymbol{w}} \\ \pi^* \end{pmatrix} (\vartheta, \boldsymbol{x}, z) = \begin{pmatrix} \Theta^* \\ \boldsymbol{U}^* \\ W^* \\ \Pi^* \end{pmatrix} (z) \, \exp\left(i \left[\boldsymbol{\omega}\vartheta - \boldsymbol{\lambda} \cdot \boldsymbol{x}\right]\right)$$

Relation between compressible and pseudo-incompressible vertical modes

$$-\frac{d}{dz}\left(\underbrace{\frac{1}{1-\varepsilon^{\mu}\frac{\omega^{2}/\lambda^{2}}{\overline{c^{2}}}}\frac{1}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,\frac{dW^{*}}{dz}\right)+\frac{\lambda^{2}}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,W^{*}\,=\,\frac{1}{\omega^{2}}\,\frac{\lambda^{2}N^{2}}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,W^{*}$$

 $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\mu}} = 0$: pseudo-incompressible case

regular Sturm-Liouville problem for internal wave modes (rigid lid)

$\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{\boldsymbol{\mu}} > 0$: compressible case

nonlinear Sturm-Liouville problem ...

$${\omega^2/\lambda^2\over \overline{c}^2}=O(1)$$
 : perturbations of pseudo-incompressible modes & EVals

$$-\frac{d}{dz}\left(\underbrace{\frac{1}{1-\varepsilon^{\mu}\frac{\omega^{2}/\lambda^{2}}{\overline{c^{2}}}}\frac{1}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,\frac{dW^{*}}{dz}\right)+\frac{\lambda^{2}}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,W^{*}\,=\,\frac{1}{\omega^{2}}\,\frac{\lambda^{2}N^{2}}{\overline{\theta}\,\overline{P}}\,W^{*}$$

Internal wave modes $\left(\frac{\omega^2/\lambda^2}{\overline{c}^2} = O(1)\right)$

- pseudo-incompressible modes/EVals = compressible modes/EVals + $O(\varepsilon^{\mu})$ **†**
- phase errors remain small *over advection time scales* for $\mu > \frac{2}{3}$

The anelastic and pseudo-incompressible models remain relevant for stratifications

$$\frac{1}{\overline{\theta}}\frac{d\overline{\theta}}{dz} < O(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^{2/3}) \qquad \Rightarrow \qquad \Delta \theta |_0^{h_{\rm sc}} \lesssim 40 \text{ K}$$

not merely up to $O(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}^2)$ as in Ogura-Phillips (1962)

A typical vertical structure function ($L \sim \pi h_{\rm sc} \sim 30$ km)





thanks to Dr. V. LeDoux, Ghent, for the SL-solver MATSLISE!

Remarks

- Estimates are uniform in the horizontal long-wave limit *(Coriolis not yet included)*
- Regime of validity includes **isothermal stratification** if

$$\frac{\gamma-1}{\gamma}\sim \pmb{\varepsilon}^{2/3}$$
 (Newtonian Limit*)

Remarks

- Estimates are uniform in the horizontal long-wave limit *(Coriolis not yet included)*
- Regime of validity includes **isothermal stratification** if

$$0.286 \approx \frac{\gamma-1}{\gamma} \sim \varepsilon^{2/3} \approx 0.25 \qquad (\varepsilon = 1/8)$$
 (Newtonian Limit*)

Regime(s) of validity of sound-proof models

Background

Stratification limit in the design-regime

Wave-breaking regime with strong stratification

Summary

Achatz, K., Senf, JFM, 663, 120–147 (2010)

Breaking wave-test for anelastic models (Smolarkiewicz & Margolin (1997))

60 km



Time scale gap for short wave lengths $L \sim 2\pi \text{ km}$



WKB theory:

- $\sim 2\pi$ km wave packets
- modulated over $\sim 10 \text{ km}$ distances
- θ -stratification of order O(1)
- scalings allow for overturning of θ -contours



Expansion scheme:

$$U(t, \boldsymbol{x}, z; \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}) = \overline{U}(z) + U_1^{(0)} \exp\left(i\frac{\varphi^{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}\right) + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \sum_{n=0}^2 U_n^{(1)} \exp\left(in\frac{\varphi^{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}}{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}}\right)$$
$$\varphi^{\boldsymbol{\varepsilon}} = \varphi^{(0)} + \boldsymbol{\varepsilon}\varphi^{(1)} + o(\boldsymbol{\varepsilon})$$
$$\left(U_n^{(i)}, \varphi^{(i)}\right) \equiv \left(U_n^{(i)}, \varphi^{(i)}\right) (t, \boldsymbol{x}, z)$$

Leading order: — classical Boussinesq / ray tracing theory

$$\begin{pmatrix} -i\hat{\omega} & 0 & 0 & ik \\ 0 & -i\hat{\omega} & -N & im \\ 0 & N & -i\hat{\omega} & 0 \\ ik & im & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \hat{U}^{(0)} \\ \hat{W}^{(0)} \\ \frac{1}{N}\frac{\hat{\Theta}^{(1)}}{\hat{\theta}^{(0)}} \\ \hat{\theta}^{(0)}\hat{\Pi}^{(2)} \end{pmatrix} = 0 \quad \text{where} \quad \begin{cases} \hat{\omega} = -\frac{\partial\varphi^{(0)}}{\partial t} - ku_0^{(0)} \\ k = \frac{\partial\varphi^{(0)}}{\partial x} \\ m = \frac{\partial\varphi^{(0)}}{\partial z} \end{cases}$$

 $M(\hat{\omega},k,m)$

Wave breaking regime, strong stratification

First order:

$$M^{(0)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N\frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(1)} + M^{(1)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N\frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(0)} = \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - W_1^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_0^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \chi} \\ -\frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \zeta} \\ \frac{1}{N} \left[-\frac{\partial}{\partial \tau} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) \right] \\ -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \frac{1-\kappa}{\kappa} \frac{W_1^{(0)}}{\pi^{(0)}} \frac{\partial \pi^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} \end{pmatrix}$$

First order: phase corrections

$$M^{(0)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(1)} + M^{(1)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(0)} = \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - W_1^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_0^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \chi} \\ -\frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \zeta} \\ \frac{1}{N} \left[-\frac{\partial}{\partial \tau} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) \right] \\ -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \frac{1-\kappa}{\kappa} \frac{W_1^{(0)}}{\pi^{(0)}} \frac{\partial \pi^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} \end{pmatrix}$$

• First-order Hamilton-Jacobi-eqn. for $\varphi^{(1)}$

First order: pseudo-incompressible corrections

$$M^{(0)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(1)} + M^{(1)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(0)} = \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - W_1^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_0^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \chi} \\ -\frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \zeta} \\ \frac{1}{N} \left[-\frac{\partial}{\partial \tau} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) \right] \\ -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \frac{1 - \kappa}{\kappa} \frac{W_1^{(0)}}{\pi^{(0)}} \frac{\partial \pi^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} \end{pmatrix}$$

• **pseudo-incompressible** wave action conservation law

First order: higher harmonics

$$M^{(0)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(1)} + M^{(1)} \begin{pmatrix} U_1 \\ W_1 \\ \frac{1}{N \frac{\Theta}{\theta}} \\ \overline{\theta}\Pi_1 \end{pmatrix}^{(0)} = \begin{pmatrix} -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - W_1^{(0)} \frac{\partial U_0^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \chi} \\ -\frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \tau} - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial W_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \theta^{(0)} \frac{\partial \Pi_1^{(2)}}{\partial \zeta} \\ \frac{1}{N} \left[-\frac{\partial}{\partial \tau} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) - U_0^{(0)} \frac{\partial}{\partial \chi} \left(\frac{\Theta_1^{(1)}}{\theta^{(0)}} \right) \right] \\ -\frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \chi} - \frac{\partial U_1^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} - \frac{1 - \kappa}{\kappa} \frac{W_1^{(0)}}{\pi^{(0)}} \frac{\partial \pi^{(0)}}{\partial \zeta} \end{pmatrix}$$

+ Nonlinear Effects:

Explicit solutions for all higher-oder modes $\sim \exp\left(i n \varphi^{(1)} / \varepsilon\right)$, (n = 1, 2, ...)



Regime(s) of validity of sound-proof models

Background

Stratification limit in the design-regime

Wave-breaking regime with strong stratification

Summary





Compressible flow equations

$$\rho_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v) = 0$$

$$\rho u_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v \circ u) + P \nabla_{\parallel} \pi = 0$$

$$(\rho w_t + \nabla \cdot (\rho v w) + P \pi_z = -\rho g$$

$$P_t + \nabla \cdot (P v) = 0$$

drop term for:

anelastic (approx.)

pseudo-incompressible

$$P = p^{\frac{1}{\gamma}} = \rho \theta$$
, $\pi = p/\Gamma P$, $\Gamma = c_p/R$, $\boldsymbol{v} = \boldsymbol{u} + w \boldsymbol{k}$, $(\boldsymbol{u} \cdot \boldsymbol{k} \equiv 0)$

Summary





Pseudo-incompressible model wins by small margin